ക്കാതെ അനുകൂലിച്ച് മറ്റു സഭ്യന്മാരുടെ നിങ്ങളുടെ പ്രസ്താവന തിരുത്തുകയാണോ തീർച്ചയെന്ന് കൂടി അപേക്ഷിച്ചുകൊണ്ട് ഞാൻ ഈ പ്രമേയത്തെ പ്രസ്താവിക്കുന്നു.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Sir, on a point of information may I know from the Comptroller of Accounts, what will be the saving under each head if the cuts intended by the resolution are given effect to.

Deputy President.—The Hon'ble Member was here and he could have asked for the information before the reply of the mover. The question ought to have been put before.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—The figures had not been given.

Deputy President.—The Hon'ble Member could have asked the question before the reply was made. Now, I cannot allow the question to be put.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Unfortunately the closure was asked for.

Mr. K. Ayyappan.—Fortunately.

The resolution was put to votes and carried.

Mr. E. Ikkanda Warriar.—A poll, Sir.

The House divided —Ayes 19, Noes 16 and Neutral 1.

Ayes.

1	Mr. K. Ayyappan	11	Mr. A. I. Mani
2	,, A. Eachara Menon	12	,, Paul Mampilly
3	,, George Chakyamuri	13	,, T. A. Ramachandra Ayyar
4	,, C. N. Ittirari Nambudiri	14	,, P. Raman menon
5	,, E. Ikkanda Warriar	15	Dr. A. R. Menon
6	,, Joseph Pettah	16	Mr. A. Sankara Poduval
7	,, P. S. Kesavan Nambudiri	17	Dr. K. Sankara Menon
8	,, P. Krishna Menon	18	Mr. K. Mohamed Seethi
9	,, T. K. Nayar	19	Mrs. Swaris.
10	,, P. Kumaran Ezhuthassan		

Noes.

1	Mr. V. K. Aravindaksha Menon	9	Mr. I. N. Menon
2	,, C. Barton Wright	10	,, P. Nilakanta Menon
3	,, U. Kandar Menon	11	Dr. D. Raghavendra Rao
4	,, T. V. Kasturi Ranga Ayyar	12	Mr. M. K. Raman
5	,, K. P. Kannan Nayar	13	,, K. Ramunni Menon
6	,, M. Krishna Menon	14	,, P. V. Raphael
7	,, K. Krishna Pisharodi	15	,, T. S. Sesha Ayyar
8	,, C. J. Mathew	16	Mr. K. P. Vallon

Neutral

1 Mr. C. A. Ouseph

7. Compulsory Primary Education for Muslims

Mr. K. Mohamed Seethi.—Sir, the resolution that stands in my name runs thus:—"This Council recommends to then Government that primary education should be made compulsory for Muslims in the State".

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Sir, the demand for introducing free compulsory education in the State is not new to the Government or to this House. As early as the Makaram Legislative Session of 1101 this demand for the introduction of compulsion came up before this House and there was a full free debate on that question. Going through the proceedings of that Legislative Session, I find that the attitude taken up by the Government on this question was not one of opposition to the move, but was one of defence for the non-introduction of that reform, because according to them there was no necessity for introducing compulsion. The spokesman on the Government side then said that even without compulsion, we could secure a very high percentage of our pupils for education and as such it would not be worthwhile and necessary to resort to compulsion. I am referring to the Legislative Council proceedings Vol. II, First series, page 593, where the Government Member after speaking at length on the pros and cons of the proposition concluded the discussion by saying that if a necessity arose to consider the desirability of introducing compulsion in the case of certain communities who according to him stood in need of compulsion as far as primary education was concerned, if such a necessity arose the Government would be only too glad to consider the desirability of doing that. "As I said yesterday, it would be a wrong policy-wrong from the economic point of view as well as from other points of view—to introduce compulsion, when you find that you could achieve better results by pursuing other methods. Let us go on as we have been doing, and within 4 or 5 years' time we shall be able to form our plans and policy and then, if necessary, we will resort to compulsion." That was the attitude of the Government then. The Hon'ble Members of this House will be pleased to note that even though we have been going on with the idea of achieving the maximum result without resorting to compulsion, we have not achieved what we were aiming at. You will be able to know, Sir, that the percentage of literacy among the Muslims for whom I advocate compulsion is as low as 13.4 according to the latest Census figures which means that more than 86 people out of hundred are still illiterate and as for the percentage of boys and girls of school-going age attending schools, you will be pleased to note that only 27 per cent of the boys and girls of the school-going age in the Muslim Community are actually attending schools. This is a very sad state of affairs. If we look at the comparative statistics of literacy in the various communities of the State the Muslims would be found to be behind all communities. Their position is the worst in the matter of literacy. Even though the spokesman of the Government said four or five years

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

ago that if we would proceed with the propaganda of education in the way in whichwe are doing now we could achieve the purpose of compulsion, but we do not find ourselves now in any the better position, and if we continue in this fashion there is no knowing when we would be able to achieve at least a fair amount of progress for the Muslim Community in the matter of education. That compulsion is not an improper policy for the Government to pursue has been conceded by the Government; that compulsion will in certain circumstances be necessary is also conceded by the Government. It was conceded by the Government in the course of a debate on the motion which I was just now referring to, that in the case of communities like the Muslims, and certain other backward communities, there was justification for introducing compulsion. But they said "let us wait and see what the results we will be able to achieve without compulsion." We have now found what result we could achieve. The present position is that 86 out of one hundred Muslims are illiterate and about 27 out of 100 boys and girls of school-going age alone are attending any school whatsoever. This state of affairs is very sad indeed.

My friend the Member for Cheruthuruthi is asking me whether any improvment during the past 5 years has been made. I find from the satistics supplied to me in answer to my question, from 1097 onwards that there is some gradual increase in the number of boys and girls. But I submit that that increase in number progress, is not commensurate with the expenditure incurred by the Government. Government are giving certain concessions for Muslim education. They are appointing Quran Teachers. They are appointing Arabic Teachers. They are giving some stipends and with all these concessions the result that we have achieved is very inadequate indeed! So my respectful submission to this House as well as to the Government is, that if we want to have our money's worth, if we want to have adequate results from the expenditure that we incur for Muslim Education, we have to resort to compulsion. Unless we do that, the money spent on Muslim education will be practically useless. I do not deny that if the State spends money and holds out concessions there is bound to be a slight improvement in the number of Muslim boys and girls in schools. But that is not what we aim at. We want universal education and if that is our aim, this sort of progress can never bring that happy consummation. From 1102 onwards the progress made is not appreciable. In 1102 the number of Muslims attending schools was 3706; while in 1106 it is, 4870. There is only an increase of about 1000 boys and girls in the course of 4 years. In 1105

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

it was 4869 while in 1106 it is only 4870. There is only an increase of one in the course of one year. So the progress is very slow and unsatisfactory indeed. Unless the recommendation which I make with regard to compulsion is carried out by the Government we can be only very pessimistic about the future of Muslim Education.

I might be asked in this connection why I narrowed down the scope of the resolution and confined my recommendations to the Muslims alone. I have done it only for this reason, not because I do not believe in the benefits of introducing free and compulsory education in the whole State, but because I feel that some practical difficulties might be flung in my face as to the acceptance of my resolution. I thought that if the Muslims are comprehended within the scope of my resolution and if the proposition is accepted by the Government to that extent, they will be only paving the way up for universal compulsory education in the State and widening the scope of literacy and enlightenment in the State. So the purpose of those who advocate universal compulsory education is partly served by my resolution. I thought State it if I made the demand for compulsion for the whole would be turned down as impracticable and that was why I narrowed down the scope of my resolution. If the Government in the course of the discussion, say that this sort of sectarian and piece-meal reform they do not want, but they want universal free education for the whole State, I would be the first to congratulate the Government. But if they go further and say that since universal compulsory education cannot be introduced now, no compulsion can be introduced at all, that is not a reasonable position for the Government to take up. If they cannot do the whole of a thing, can't they do a part of it at least? Something is better than nothing is the old adage which is rightly applicable to this question. Sir, I do not want to indulge in an enumeration of the virtues of compulsion in education. I find from the discussion that we had in 1101 that our Government said that they needed no argument whatsoever to convince them of the desirability of compulsion in certain circumstances. They said argument on that point was superfluous. They did not consider compulsion in any way objectionable. I do not therefore, want to speak anything in justification of the principle of compulsion. I say in the case of Muslims compulsion is necessary. Unless compulsion is resorted to by the Government, the expenditure incurred by the Government will be barren of fruits. I may also submit in this connection that schools may not have to be multiplied at all. We have a sufficient number of schools in the State to accommodate all the boys and girls of the Muslim

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Community. After all the number of Muslims that will be brought under the influence of education will be about 12 or 13 thousand. I wonder whether my calculation is correct, because I find it very difficult to get definite statistics. I was relying on materials supplied by way of information on the floor of this House and from the statistics given in the Administration report. But I was not able to reconcile the figures and hence I am only giving approximate figures. I may say that the Muslim children of school-age will not exceed 13 thousand and it will not be very difficult for the Government to accommodate that number with the present schools. Sir, I have nothing more to add in commending this resolution for the acceptance of the Government and this House. My only submission is that this resolution recommends only a right move in the right direction and the acceptance thereof will only justify the sympathetic policy that the Government is pursuing in the matter of Muslim Education and the education of other backward communities. With these words I commend this resolution for the acceptance of this House.

Mr. Joseph Pettah.—I second this resolution.

Deputy President.—Before proceeding further, I want to say that we have not advanced much in our resolutions and the work of the Council. So I request the Members to be brief and confine themselves to the point at issue, so that we may push on our work at least to some extent. I want to call the attention of the Members to the limit.

Mr. K. Ayyappan.—"Add 'and other communities backward in education and the depressed classes' after the word 'Muslims' and before the words 'in the State'"—Sir, the resolution as amended runs thus :—"This Council recommends to the Government that Primary Education should be made compulsory for Muslims and other communities backward in education and the depressed classes in the State".

മുസ്ലീമിങ്ങൾക്കുമാത്രമെങ്കിലും നിർബ്ബന്ധവിദ്യാഭ്യാസം ഏർപ്പെടുത്തുവാൻ കഴിയുമെങ്കിൽ അതിനുവിപരീതമായി നില്ക്കുന്നവെന്നു് എനിക്കു് ഉദ്ദേശമില്ല. കഴിയുന്നതും സ്റ്റേറ്റ് ഒട്ടുക്കു് വിദ്യാഭ്യാസം നിർബ്ബന്ധിതമാക്കണം. അതുസാധിയ്ക്കുന്നില്ലെങ്കിൽ വിദ്യാഭ്യാസത്തിൽ പിന്നോക്കം നില്ക്കുന്ന നമ്പൂതിരിമാർ, ഈഴവർ മുതലായ ജാതിക്കാർക്കും അധഃകൃതസമുദായങ്ങൾക്കും എങ്കിലും നിർബ്ബന്ധവിദ്യാഭ്യാസം നടപ്പാക്കിയാൽകൊള്ളാം. ഇവിടെ ഇപ്പോൾ പ്രാഥമിക വിദ്യാഭ്യാസത്തിനു ഫീസ്സില്ല. രാജ്യത്തിന്റെ എല്ലാഭാഗങ്ങളിലും സ്കൂളുകളുമുണ്ടു്. സ്കൂളുകൾ ചിലസ്ഥലങ്ങളിൽ അധികമായിപ്പോയിഎന്നുകൂടി ചിലർക്കു അഭിപ്രായമുണ്ടു്. ഈസ്ഥിതിക്കു് നിർബ്ബന്ധവിദ്യാഭ്യാസം ഏർപ്പെടുത്തുന്നതായാൽ ഇപ്പോഴത്തേതിലും വളരെ അധികമായ ചിലവു വേണ്ടിവ

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

രീകില്ല. ഏതായാലും എല്ലാവർക്കും നിർബ്ബന്ധ വിദ്യാഭ്യാസം ഏർപ്പെടുത്തുവാൻ സാധിക്കുന്നില്ലെങ്കിൽ മുസ്ലീമിങ്ങൾക്കെങ്കിലും ഈ ഭാഗം ഉണ്ടാകുന്നതിന്നു ഞാൻ വിരോധിയല്ലെന്നു വീണ്ടും പറഞ്ഞുകൊള്ളുന്നു.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Sir, however much I may sympathise with this resolution—and I was one who moved that compulsory education should be introduced in the State—there are certain practical difficulties which ought to be fully realised in the application of this principle of compulsion in general education. The question arises so far as the communities that do not send their children—

Deputy President.—Do you second the amendment?

Mr. K. Ayyappan.—Is it necessary? I think that the amendment need not be seconded.

Deputy President.—I thought the Hon'ble Member was going to second the amendment.

Mr. T. A. Ramachandra Ayyar.—I second it.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Without either supporting or opposing I am going to deal with the general proposition. When you introduce compulsory education, the parents are held responsible to send their children and if you do not enforce upon the parents to send their children, then the idea of compulsion is worthless. But if you insist upon it and the parents complain of poverty, it forms the duty of the State to provide some means of alleviating their miserable conditions so that these scholars may be given sometimes food, sometimes clothes, sometimes books. All these things are included when compulsion is resorted to and in the second place my opinion is if you are going to introduce compulsion, all the institutions must be under the control of the Government. I do not believe and I assert more than once that the public instruction in the primary department should not be handed over to any private agency, but must completely be under the supervision of the Government, so that there may be a uniformity and a uniformity of authority over the various institutions. It will be very difficult if you hand over the schools to various authorities and try to bring them all on a uniform level. Thus, we come to this question. All these, so far as primary education is concerned. My opinion is different with regard to High School education. Hand it over to private agencies. So far as the primary school is concerned, the Government must take the responsibility. I believe everywhere the primary education has been made compulsory, the controlling authority is either the board or the county board or the Government and not any private agency. There are various objections why such schools should be in the hands of

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

private agencies. I can boldly assert in this Council that out of 100 schools at least 90 schools are falsifying the number of students that attend schools, so that they may get grants. There is no doubt about it. I personally know that generally in night schools there are 3 classes. As soon as the Inspector went, they removed the boys from one class to the other. He was shrewd enough to find this out. Then he found out that the same boys who were sitting in the first standard were sitting in the second standard. Immediately messengers are sent to pick up all the boys from the streets, so as to fill the classes. These things are done. I don't think all of them are doing it. And if the Government is going to undertake this work it means an enormous expense and it means an expense in the right direction. There is no expense that could be justified by the Government with such reasonableness as the expense that they would incur in introducing compulsory primary education. And I am also not in favour of a differentiation between the two kinds of primary schools. Let it be a uniform standard. Instead of having a primary school with 4th standard, but cannot proceed to the 1st form, let it be the same school, the same classes and let the same kind of instruction be given to the richest and the poorest in the land. If you can do all these things, then that is the best thing. If you cannot do it or if you can do anything for my friend's resolution including this amendment, you are welcome to do it. But personally I think this is a problem which ought to be grappled after profound thought. You must introduce free, compulsory primary education under the direct supervision and agency of the Government. That is the position in this matter and that was the position that I took seven years ago.

Mr. Joseph Pettah.—On a point of information, Sir. May I know, Sir, what would be the additional commitment on the part of the Government if universal compulsory free primary education is introduced?

Mr. I. N. Menon.—Sir, it is not possible to tell off-hand what would be the commitment. But I can say the directions in which money will have to be spent.

There seems to be an idea that all that is required is compulsion. Take the case of County Council schools in England. In the district of London, there are a hundred attendance officers to compel attendance. They will have to be appointed here also. Otherwise this compulsion would be a dead letter. And, here, secondly, with the progress I have made in connection with the Educational Survey, I find that although we have a large number of schools, if you take the whole population of school-going children who ought to be at school, we have to

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

provide more schools. So, it means that even the existing number of schools will be found insufficient. If you want to compel attendance it means more school buildings. Then again some of the progressive countries have also provided mid-day meals for indigent children. All these things have to be discussed. So, I cannot say off-hand what the additional commitment will be in actual figures. These are some of the directions in which fresh commitments will have to be undertaken.

Deputy President.—Government side may answer.

Mr. I. N. Menon.—Sir, I have absolutely no quarrel with the resolution, except that it attempts to do piece-meal what ought to be done all at once. I say we should not attempt compulsion piece-meal in this way. It may be attempted piece-meal in a different way. For instance, compulsion may be tried in different areas. Now, for instance you may introduce compulsion in the case of Municipalities and selected Panchayats, and we can see what the actual commitment will be. But if you apply to a particular community, it is very difficult to find what the effects of compulsion will be. It does not mean that I am fighting against compulsion, and compulsion may be found necessary if we have to bring into the fold of these schools all the children who are still outside our schools. The latest statistics show that over 40 per cent of our children of school-going age are outside schools.

Mr. E. Ikkanda Warriar.—Our late Director was saying only 10 per cent was outside schools.

Mr. I. N. Menon.—I say, taking school-going age at the years of 6 to 12. I do not know whether any other basis was followed. If you take it at 6 to 14 it would be more than 48 per cent. I calculated from 6 to 12. Even on that basis it will be more than 40 per cent. One thing that we are trying to find out in the research is to see whether there are enough number of buildings. How do we proceed? We proceed in this way, and there is the example of other surveys conducted by London and Oxford. Calculating each teacher, to be capable of handling 35 or 40 children, the number of teachers which we possess and the number of children who have to come into our schools, (granting that there is accommodation and equipment,) I find we have a shortage of school places in the areas which I have surveyed. Now coming to the particular point at issue, as the Hon'ble Member said, there is some difficulty about the statistics. Actual statistics as shown by the latest census are somewhat different from what he stated. I take this from the statistics supplied by the Superintendent of Census. The

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

number of Muslim boys of school-going age is 7016. Of these 7016, 4870 are in schools or colleges. Now in the case of girls it is different. Are these incorrect? These are supplied by the Census Superintendent. There are 7488 girls of which 1738 are receiving instruction. That is to say, 69·4 per cent in the case of boys and 23·1 in the case of girls. Taking the whole average for the State, 69·4 is not bad. As I said, 48 per cent are outside schools taking all communities. I am not saying that it is right or wise to leave these children uninstructed. Now, 23·1 is certainly very low. Now the remedy that is proposed, I suppose is the only remedy which can be tried, and the only question is whether it is necessary or wise to try to do it piece-meal with regard to different communities. The Hon'ble mover of the amendment showed the feeling that it should not be restricted to one community, but should be extended to other communities; and I personally feel if anything is to be done, it may have to be extended to the whole State. But, if it is to be tried as an experiment, it must be localised. It must not be tried in respect of selected communities, but tried in selected areas. There are one or two small difficulties about trying compulsion. I have had very large occasion to visit the cottages of children who are actually not attending schools, and if anything is evident, it is poverty. People are saying after all education in the State is free, and the idea would be that education costs nothing to the parent. It is not so. After all, fees may be at the outset 2 annas. The cost of clothing, giving proper meals at the proper hour,—all these devolve on the poor parent. For instance in some villages in the Chittur Taluk, I find that if compulsion is introduced directly it will be an act of pure hostility against the poor people. I am referring to the Chakkilia colonies in Meenakshipuram and other villages. I went there and they told me 'we don't want Government to come and tell us that education is a necessity, we have more brains than Government think we possess. The only thing is our children are either going with us to the fields or minding our homes in the absence of the elders. Now, what would Government do to do either of these tasks if we send our children to school.' It is a very reasonable protest. The economic conditions in some cases are so distressing that unless we alleviate them, compulsory education will be a hardship. The question is whether these hardships should be preferred to education. These are the two points to be considered. Then again, the cost of compulsion. The Member for Muslims said it is practically nothing. It is not so. For one thing I say the Hon'ble Member who wanted concessions which are now

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

given to the Muslims, to be extended to everyone who comes to school. I suppose I am right.

Mr. K. Mohamed Seethi.—What are those concessions. When I referred to the concessions, I specially meant the appointment of Quran teachers.

Mr. I. N. Menon.—I mean for instance, concessions in the matter of fees, books and stipends. Stipends are given to Muslim girls joining schools.

Mr. K. Mohamed Seethi.—No stipends are given to Muslim girls.

Mr. I. N. Menon.—In any case there is the question of the possibility of having got to increase the number of buildings. It may be a bare possibility. Secondly there is the machinery which is required for the regimentation and the enforcement of rules. You have got to appoint attendance officers or attendance committees to see whether these children are actually attending. It is no use enacting a law or a code and leaving it to the good sense of the people to observe. You have to enforce vigilance. All this means a certain amount of additional expenditure. I do not say that education is a matter in which expenditure should be pleaded as an excuse for not giving it. I do mean that expenditure should not be ignored. It is not so trifling as you might think. On a previous occasion when I had to speak on an identical proposition in a different connection I said the measure was not quite mature, because we were just collecting statistics to find out as to what communities should be treated in this fashion. For instance there is the Nambudiri community. They are not poor, but nothing short of compulsion will, it appears to me, bring them to the schools. Now, for instance, there are the so-called backward classes who are, if these statistics are correct, more backward in point of education than the Muslims. We cannot leave them out. So, as the amendment is very pertinent compulsion has to be extended, and if it is purely as an experiment it may by tried in specially localised areas. For instance, choose a Municipality. I am sure there must be a fairly large number of Muslims inside the municipal areas.

Mr. K. Mohamed Seethi.—In Mattancheri there may be Muslims.

Mr. I. N. Menon.—So, any way if compulsion is tried as an experiment, it must be tried in a localised area. I hope to submit the proposals on the survey before the Budget Session and if the Hon'ble Member will give me time to prepare these things, I would be able to give definite information supported by facts and figures. I am not opposing the principle and I say it is highly necessary to introduce compulsion, probably to ex-

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

tend it to other communities as well. But I would like to know as the Hon'ble Member for Adoor, said the amount of the commitment, and the extent of administrative machinery that is required. All these will have to be appraised before actually introducing compulsion. I have absolutely no quarrel with this resolution. I only say that a consideration of this may be postponed till the report of the survey is available to the House.

Mr. K. Mohamed Seethi.—Sir, I am quite agreeable to the wishes of the Hon'ble Member for Education that the consideration of this resolution must await the result of his investigation in this direction and we may have it on another occasion. I don't think it profitable to add to the discussion on the various points raised by the Hon'ble Member for Education just at present. So, I withdraw this resolution.

The resolution was, with leave, withdrawn.

8. Land Mortgage Bank.

Mr. Joseph Pettah.—Sir, I rise to move that "This Council recommends to the Government that early steps be taken for the establishment of a Land Mortgage Bank in Cochin."

Deputy President.—At the same time I may suggest there are some other resolutions standing in the names of other Members also about this Land Mortgage Bank. They may also take part in this resolution.

Mr. E. Ikkanda Warriar.—There is one standing in my name.

Mr. Joseph Pettah.—Sir, in moving this resolution, I have the great satisfaction that I come after a very vigorous speech made by the Leader of the House on behalf of the Government, assuring us that there is enough money in the Government's coffers, and that want of funds would not be advanced against any useful project that is suggested or proposed in this House. As regards the necessity of Land Mortgage Banks, I don't think there is any necessity for a long speech. In all the civilised countries of the world, or at least in almost all of them, Land Mortgage Banks have been already established, and therefore, it would not be necessary——once again I say—for me to make a long speech to establish the necessity of starting a similar bank in the Cochin State also. The purpose of a Land Mortgage Bank, as the Hon'ble Members know, is to relieve the agriculturists, who, it may be noted, could not be relieved by the modern banks. Agriculturists require loans generally for two purposes. Either they may be short loans for purposes of current cultivation, or they may be long term loans for purpose of effecting improvements in the lands, which would begin to pay only after a long period of years. In the matter of the first requirement, ordinary banks might go to their help

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly